

INSTRUCTIONAL TASK 19 MODEL

TASK 19 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

STEP 1: Select two texts related to similar topics (article and textbook, articles and primary sources, two primary sources, etc).

STEP 2: Provide students with a frame of reference for comparing the two texts, by limiting the scope of the comparison, students can focus their reading on one element. Students can compare and contrast:

- word choice in texts written in different eras/for different audiences/in different formats
- text structure in texts written in different eras/for different audiences/in different formats
- symbols and/or images in texts written in different eras/for different audiences/in different formats
- author view of historical/cultural issue
- historical context of each piece and how that might influence the authors views

FROM: GROWING UP COLORED (COLLECTION #09002)
Joseph Jackson's Annual Address

ACCESSED JUNE 11, 2013

<http://teachingamericanhistory.org/library/document/annual-address/>

Many segregationists fear that granting equality of opportunity to people of color will in some way jeopardize their liberties, encroach upon their freedom, and threaten their rank, position, and security. But such fear is unfounded if the doctrine of American democracy is true. For no free man has any grounds to fear the spread of the privileges of true freedom to all men, for the greater the number of free men the more secure is freedom and less is the power and danger of oppression. Abraham Lincoln sensed this fact when he said: "By giving freedom to the slaves we insure freedom to the free." The presence of one bound man pollutes the whole stream of human society; and the rattle of one chain of oppression creates a discord that breaks the harmony in every democratic system, and disturbs the mind and poisons the heart of every man with fear and dread, so that the would-be master finds himself mentally and morally the dweller in the hovels of slaves, the servant of a cause that is hostile to democracy, and becomes himself, the victim of the baser emotions of his own nature.



Labeling?

This is a call to action, written in the present tense, during the time of segregation



Text emphasizes the word freedom, uses Abraham Lincoln as role model to establish the logic that freedom for all does not detract from the freedom of some....
-ROBERT

INSTRUCTIONAL TASK 19 MODEL (continued)

FROM: GROWING UP COLORED (COLLECTION #09002)

by Henry L. Gates

ACCESSED JUNE 11, 2013

<http://www.americanheritage.com/content/growing-colored?page=show>

Whatever tumult our small screen revealed, though, the dawn of the civil rights era could be no more than a spectator sport in Piedmont. It was almost like a war being fought overseas. And all things considered, white and colored Piedmont got along pretty well in those years, the 50s and early 60s. At least as long as colored people didn't try to sit down in the Cut-Rate or at the Rendezvous Bar, or eat pizza at Eddie's, or buy property, or move into the white neighborhoods, or dance with, date, or dilate upon white people. Not to mention try to get a job in the craft unions at the paper mill. Or have a drink at the white VFW, or join the white American Legion, or get loans at the bank. Or just generally didn't get out of line. Other than that, colored and white got on pretty well.

Basically, as long as Black people understood and accepted that they had no place in white society

Author uses verbal irony, by repeating the phrase that he says in the beginning then qualifies all the ways whites and blacks don't "get along" -ROB

STEP 3: Students complete reading both texts without stopping.

STEP 4: They then re-read the texts, annotating based on the frame of reference.

STEP 5: Using the Comparative Analysis Organizer included below, students take notes, establish the grounds for comparison, draft a thesis, and determine the organizational structure the essay will follow.

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS ORGANIZER

TEXTS:

Joseph Jackson, "Annual Address" and Henry I. Gates, "Growing Up Colored"

Frame of Reference (what am I comparing within these texts):

Both address the idea of civil rights for African Americans, although one is a speech written in the present tense, one is an essay written in the past tense.

Grounds for Comparison (why are these two texts appropriate for this task):

While both address the same topic, they use different word choice in texts written in different eras/for different audiences/in different formats.

Similarities/Differences between the texts:

Joseph Jackson

Henry I. Gates

More formal tone, addresses audience in the present tense, a call to action. Uses rhetoric and logic to make the case, emphasizes the positive aspects of allowing civil rights for all people. Persuasive Speech

Essay written about the past, more conversational style, more a critique on society, uses a lot of irony. Informative Essay

THESIS:

Although both Joseph Jackson's "Annual Address", and Henry L. Gates' "Growing Up Colored", address the issue of segregation in America, the authors use different word choice and tone, reflective of their audiences and purpose. Jackson's eloquence and use of rhetoric are a call to arms, demanding an end to segregation; while Gate's essay ranges from whimsical to sharply ironic in recalling a "sepia" era that, in the minds of many African Americans, is not an ideal or wholly positive memory.

Organization: Point by Point or Text by Text
Why?

I would use text by text; because the works are so different in tone, audience, and era, it makes more sense to examine each as a whole, and then draw a conclusion supporting my thesis.